

STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA

FILED

IN THE GENERAL COURT OF JUSTICE

COUNTY OF WAKE

SUPERIOR COURT DIVISION

95-CVS-1158

HOKE COUNTY BOARD OF  
EDUCATION, et al.,

2021 DEC -3 P 4:17

Plaintiffs,

WAKE CO. C.S.C.

and

BY

CHARLOTTE-MECKLENBURG BOARD  
OF EDUCATION,

Plaintiff-Intervenor,

and

RAFAEL PENN, et al.,

Plaintiff-Intervenors,

v.

STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA and the  
STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION,

Defendants,

and

CHARLOTTE-MECKLENBURG BOARD  
OF EDUCATION,

Realigned Defendant,

and

PHILIP E. BERGER, in his official capacity  
as President Pro Tempore of the North  
Carolina Senate, and TIMOTHY K. MOORE,  
in his official capacity as Speaker of the  
North Carolina House of Representatives,

Intervenor-Defendants.

**NOTICE OF APPEAL BY  
INTERVENOR-DEFENDANTS**

TO THE HONORABLE COURT OF APPEALS OF NORTH CAROLINA:

Intervenor-Defendants Philip E. Berger, in his official capacity as President Pro Tempore of the North Carolina Senate, and Timothy K. Moore, in his official capacity as Speaker of the North Carolina House of Representatives, hereby give notice of appeal to the Court of Appeals of North Carolina from the Order entered in this action on November 10, 2011 by the Honorable W. David Lee.

This the 8th day of December, 2021.

**WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON (US) LLP**



---

Matthew Tilley (N.C. Bar No. 40125)  
Russ Ferguson (N.C. Bar No. 39671)  
W. Clark Goodman (N.C. Bar No. 19927)

One Wells Fargo Center, Suite 3500  
301 S. College Street  
Charlotte, North Carolina 28202-6037  
T: (704) 331-4900  
E-Mail: Matthew.Tilley@wbd-us.com  
Russ.Ferguson@wbd-us.com  
Clark.Goodman@wbd-us.com

*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendants*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned certifies that on December 8, 2021, he caused a true and correct copy of the foregoing document to be served via U.S. Mail upon the following:

H. Lawrence Armstrong  
ARMSTRONG LAW, PLLC  
P. O. Box 187  
Enfield, NC 27823  
Email: hla@hlalaw.net

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

Melanie Black Dubis  
Scott E. Bayzle  
PARKER POE ADAMS & BERNSTEIN LLP  
P. O. Box 389  
Raleigh, NC 27602-0389  
Email: melaniedubis@parkerpoe.com  
scottbayzle@parkerpoe.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

Elizabeth Haddix  
David Hinojosa  
LAWYERS COMMITTEE FOR CIVIL RIGHTS UNDER LAW  
1500 K Street NW, Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20005  
Email: ehaddix@lawyerscommittee.org  
dhinojosa@lawyerscommittee.org

*Attorneys for Penn-Intervenors*

Amar Majmundar  
Matthew Tulchin  
Tiffany Lucas  
NORTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
114 W. Edenton Street  
Raleigh, NC 27603  
Email: AMajmundar@ncdoj.gov  
MTulchin@ncdoj.gov  
TLucas@ncdoj.gov

*Counsel for State of North Carolina's Executive Branch*

Thomas J. Ziko  
STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION  
6302 Mail Service Center  
Raleigh, NC 27699-6302  
Email: Thomas.Ziko@dpi.nc.gov

*Counsel for State Board of Education*

Neal Ramee  
Daivd Nolan  
THARRINGTON SMITH, LLP  
P. O. Box 1151  
Raleigh, NC 27602  
Email: NRamee@tharringtonsmith.com  
dnoland@tharringtonsmith.com

*Counsel for Charlotte-Mecklenburg Schools*

  
Matthew F. Tilley